RISK-ADJUSTED BENCHMARKING: AN ALTERNATIVE VIEW OF MARKET RATE CHANGES

Risk-adjusted benchmarking is a significant step forward in capturing the trends underlying insurance market pricing behavior. Conceptually, risk-adjusted benchmarking contemplates changes in a company’s insurance program structure and risk profile in conjunction with the resulting changes in price that the company pays for insurance. This allows for a more complete picture of industry price changes as compared to traditional benchmarking, which considers only the change in price paid for insurance.

CHANGES IN PROGRAM STRUCTURE

Structural changes to a company’s insurance program occur with any changes to retentions and/or limits. This can result from both insurance market dynamics and/or changes in a company’s own risk appetite or profile. Because program-structure changes occur frequently, companies that experience them can provide a rich source of benchmarking information.

Traditional benchmarking includes only peers that have static retentions and limits from one policy period to the next. Risk-adjusted benchmarking includes all samples, including those with structural program changes. As a result, risk-adjusted benchmarking allows for the inclusion of many more peer companies in the analysis of insurance market behavior.

CHANGES IN RISK PROFILE

Changes in an organization’s risk profile occur for a variety of reasons. Mergers and acquisitions, expansions into new states, and changes in product offerings may drive changes in a particular risk profile.

Intuitively, it is clear that insurers must factor such change into underwriting so as to appropriately align premium with exposure. However, traditional benchmarking makes no similar allowance. Risk-adjusted benchmarking incorporates risk profile changes into the measurement of price change and, therefore, offers an enhanced alternative to traditional benchmarking in this important regard.
DIFFERENCES IN BENCHMARKING APPROACHES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TRADITIONAL BENCHMARKING</th>
<th>RISK-ADJUSTED BENCHMARKING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clients Included in Benchmarking</td>
<td>Only includes clients with the same program structure year over year.</td>
<td>Includes clients with or without changes in program structure year over year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limits</td>
<td>Only includes renewals that did not have a change in limits.</td>
<td>Includes all renewals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retentions</td>
<td>Only includes renewals that did not have a change in retention.</td>
<td>Includes all renewals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes in Risk Profile</td>
<td>No adjustments made for changes in risk profile.</td>
<td>Adjustments made for changes in risk profile.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This example can be extended to all types of changes in program structure and company risk profile. By translating this into changes in expectation of insured losses (and expenses), a price can be derived that would put the company on equal economic footing with where it stood in the prior policy period. By comparing that theoretical price with the price actually charged by the insurer, a risk-adjusted rate change can be determined.

Generally speaking, making appropriate risk adjustments in the context of benchmarking is not simple. These adjustments should be based on large quantities of individual company transactions as well as on aggregated industry data.

HOW IT WORKS

Appropriately adjusting insurer prices for changes in retention, limit, and risk profile requires an understanding of the quantitative impacts of such changes. For example, it is clear that (under normal circumstances) if an organization decreases its insurance retention, it can expect to pay a higher amount of premium while insuring to the same limit. But the amount by which the company should expect premium to increase is not at all clear without a detailed understanding of what that decrease in retention means to the insurer in terms of additional, expected sustained losses.

IMPLICATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

Traditional benchmarking provides a valid view of insurance market pricing. However, it requires the peers compared to maintain the status quo in their respective insurance program structures, and it does not contemplate underlying changes in risk profiles.

Risk-adjusted benchmarking addresses these factors and provides a clearer picture of pricing activity against current market conditions. It allows for a broader set of peer companies to be included in the measurement of price changes. Most importantly, it can increase the relevance and potential uses of the results. Companies can now use risk-adjusted benchmarking to make more informed decisions on alternative program structures with a new perspective on how insurers will react to those alternatives.

Marsh is one of the Marsh & McLennan Companies, together with Guy Carpenter, Mercer, and Oliver Wyman. This document is not intended to be taken as advice regarding any individual situation and should not be relied upon as such. The information contained herein is based on sources we believe reliable, but we make no representation or warranty as to its accuracy. Marsh shall have no obligation to update this publication and shall have no liability to you or any other party arising out of this publication or any matter contained herein. Any statements concerning actuarial, tax, accounting, or legal matters are based solely on our experience as insurance brokers and risk consultants and are not to be relied upon as actuarial, accounting, tax, or legal advice, for which you should consult your own professional advisors. Any modeling, analytics, or projections are subject to inherent uncertainty, and the Marsh Analysis could be materially affected if any underlying assumptions, conditions, information, or factors are inaccurate or incomplete or should change. Marsh makes no representation or warranty concerning the application of policy wordings or the financial condition or solvency of insurers or re-insurers. Marsh makes no assurances regarding the availability, cost, or terms of insurance coverage.

Copyright © 2013 Marsh Inc. All rights reserved.

Compliance No.: MA13-12457-4921